The Economics of Trade Facilitation

Thomas ORLIAC

Thèse dirigée par M. Patrick Messerlin,
Professeur des Universités, Institut d’Études Politiques de Paris

Soutenue le 1er février 2012

Jury :
Mme Hildegunn Kyvik Nordås,
Professor of Economics at the University of Bergen (rapporteur)
M. Richard Pomfret,
Professor of Economics at the University of Adelaide (rapporteur)
M. Thierry Mayer,
Professeur des Universités en économie à l’Institut d’Études Politiques de Paris
M. Patrick Messerlin,
Professeur des Universités en économie à l’Institut d’Études Politiques de Paris
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Résumé</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 General introduction</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 What is trade facilitation?</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1 Historical background</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2 Definition(s) of trade facilitation</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3 A component of trade costs</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 A global game with various challenges</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 International bodies</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 Customs and other border agencies</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 Economic operators</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Costs and benefits of trade facilitiation</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The remainder of the thesis</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Key performance indicators of trade facilitation</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The usual indicators of trade facilitiation</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 A review of traditional indicators</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 Limits of these databases</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Some specific measures of trade facilitation</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Time Release Studies</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Customs monitoring</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 A way towards new indicators</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 International regulatory frameworks</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Trade Agreements and Trade Facilitation</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# The Economics of Trade Facilitation

## A.3 French Customs, a case study

Page 262

## A.4 Customs duties and Revenue

Page 267

## B RTAs & FTAs, Conventions and Guidelines

- **B.1 The UNESCAP compilation of Asia-Pacific trade agreements**
  - Page 269
- **B.2 The WTO RTAs database**
  - Page 271

## C Transport costs

- **C.1 Measure and determinants of transport costs**
  - Page 276
  - **C.1.1 The measure of transport costs**
  - Page 276
  - **C.1.2 The determinants of (maritime) transport costs**
  - Page 276
  - **C.1.3 Main data provider about maritime transport components**
  - Page 278
- **C.2 Trends and key characteristics of transport costs**
  - Page 279
  - **C.2.1 Maritime traffic (in TEU)**
  - Page 279
  - **C.2.2 Freight rates**
  - Page 281
  - **C.2.3 Shipping lines and shipping routes**
  - Page 282
  - **C.2.4 Fleet statistics**
  - Page 284
  - **C.2.5 Maritime Transport Costs (MTC) database**
  - Page 284

## D The Trade Facilitation Index

- **D.1 Structure of the databases, a technical note**
  - Page 287
  - **D.1.1 Three databases**
  - Page 287
  - **D.1.2 The computing process**
  - Page 288
- **D.2 Basic statistics from the questionnaire**
  - Page 289
  - **D.2.1 The questionnaire**
  - Page 289
  - **D.2.2 Rate of reply**
  - Page 295
- **D.3 The variables**
  - Page 297
  - **D.3.1 Definitions**
  - Page 297
  - **D.3.2 Notes on variables**
  - Page 317
  - **D.3.3 Ambiguous variables**
  - Page 319
  - **D.3.4 Analysis of underlying links between variables**
  - Page 320
  - **D.3.5 Accurate vs Ambiguous datasets**
  - Page 321
  - **D.3.6 Statistics on the variables**
  - Page 321
- **D.4 The Trade Facilitation Indicators (TFIs)**
  - Page 323
  - **D.4.1 Basic statistics on the Trade Facilitation Indicators**
  - Page 323
  - **D.4.2 Composition of the indicators**
  - Page 324
  - **D.4.3 Weighting Schemes**
  - Page 324
  - **D.4.4 The Trade Facilitation Indicators (scores)**
  - Page 325
  - **D.4.5 Correlations between each component**
  - Page 327
  - **D.4.6 Complementary thoughts about the indicators**
  - Page 327
List of Figures

2.1 Time Release Study Schedule ........................................... 46
3.1 Trade agreements related to trade facilitation, by dimensions (%) ................. 53
3.2 Traffic in TEU handled by Members of the Facilitation Maritime Convention, since 4670 .......................................................... 60
4.1 Distribution of variables by categories, according to their source ...................... 74
4.2 Rate of reply to the questionnaire (Revised version) .................................. 75
4.3 Distribution of scale across the categories ............................................... 80
4.4 Information availability ........................................................................ 84
4.5 Enquiry Points .................................................................................. 84
4.6 Opening Hours of Customs supports ....................................................... 85
4.7 Involvement of trade community .......................................................... 86
4.8 Total number of advance rulings (2009) .................................................... 87
4.9 Set period of time by which an Advance Ruling is issued ............................ 87
4.10 Appeal procedures ........................................................................... 88
4.11 Procedures cleared electronically .......................................................... 90
4.12 Rate of physical inspections (% of total imports) ......................................... 91
4.13 Percent of pre-arrival processing ........................................................ 92
4.14 What are the benefits linked to AT status? ............................................... 92
4.15 External Border Agency Cooperation .................................................... 93
4.16 Impact of the TFIs on trade flows ........................................................ 99
4.17 Contribution to the variance of trade costs (%) ....................................... 104
5.1 Time to import (2006-2011) ................................................................ 108
5.2 Cost to import (2005-2011) ................................................................ 109
5.3 Number of documents to import (2006-2011) ........................................... 109
5.4 Customs Efficiency according to the WCY and the GCR ............................ 110
5.5 Customs Efficiency according to the LPI and the GETR ............................ 110
5.6 Transport and infrastructure efficiency, according to the LPI and the GETR .... 111
5.7 Rate of ratification of the main trade facilitation Conventions .................... 112
5.8 ILAC Membership and intensity (since 2001) ............................................. 112
5.9 A full and precise description of Customs procedures on Customs website? .......... 115
5.10 The forms and documents required for import are available on the Internet? ........... 115
5.11 Are new regulation and changes published for public comments prior to being implemented? ........................................................................................................ 115
5.12 Is there advance notice of the effective date? (or delayed effective date) .............. 116
5.13 Does Customs issue advance rulings on all Customs ports? ............................... 117
5.14 May decisions of local Customs officials be appealed to a higher level? ............... 117
5.15 Availability of information on appeal procedures of Customs’ decision (on internet) ........................................................................................................ 118
5.16 Are the working hours of Customs personnel adapted to commercial needs? ....... 118
5.17 Fees during Working Hours and Processing fees during Post-Release processes .... 119
5.18 Does Customs require clearance by third party Customs broker? ......................... 120
5.19 A certificate of origin from a chamber of commerce is needed? ......................... 120
5.20 A consular invoice or a consular visa for a commercial invoice is needed ......... 121
5.21 Use of EDI prior arrival to release shipments immediately after arrival? ........... 122
5.22 Average time (hours) between post-arrival data submission and shipment release 122
5.23 Is physical release of goods separate from the fiscal control? ............................ 122
5.24 What is the primary basis for physical examinations of shipments? .................... 123
5.25 Is full time automated processing for the Customs ports available? .................... 124
5.26 Are there multiple inspections? ........................................................................ 125
5.27 Is there a limit on the time within which Customs is allowed to demand additional duties? ........................................................................................................ 125
5.28 Does Customs inspect and release goods at the operator’s facility? (by air) ....... 126
5.29 Does Customs regularly use reference prices to invoice values? ....................... 126
5.30 Additional Customs rules that restrict the operation of express delivery services? 127
5.31 The Extended Customs Services Index (ECSI) and the CSI, by income groups .... 132
6.1 Transposition of Community law, in the area of Taxation and Customs Union .... 137
6.2 Agricultural weighted average tariffs (MFN) of the EU .................................. 159
6.3 Industrial weighted average tariffs (MFN) of the EU ........................................ 160
6.4 The share of EC revenue represented by Customs duties .................................. 162
6.5 Evolution of extra-EU Imports, Applied rates and Customs Revenue of the EU .. 163
6.6 An increasing cooperation between Members States (Meetings) ....................... 165
6.7 Number of projects, for all donors .................................................................... 171
6.8 European Commitments in the field of Trade Facilitation* .............................. 172
6.9 Number of projects by sub-sectors related to Trade Facilitation, since 1995 .... 173
6.10 Key European Customs Legislation and Strategies ....................................... 178
6.11 European Key Agreements and Conventions ............................................... 179
6.12 BTI issued and revoked between 2005 and 2009 ............................................ 184
6.13 Number of AEO certificates issued since 2008 in the European Union .......... 187
The Economics of Trade Facilitation

6.14 Use of appeal mechanisms across the OECD countries ........................................ 190
6.15 Repartition of cases by type of issues (1995-2010) .................................................. 212
6.16 Trade facilitation in the EU: 3 actors, 3 dimensions .................................................. 215

A.1 Japan Import Lead Time Required for Release of Goods for sea shipments .............. 255
A.2 Japan Import Lead Time Required for Release of Goods for air shipments ............... 255
A.3 Release time for sea shipments, import in Australia ................................................. 256
A.4 Release time for air shipments, import in Australia .................................................. 257
A.5 Import in Australia, Sea cargo status at arrival (%) .................................................... 257
A.6 Import in Australia, Air cargo status at arrival (%) ..................................................... 258
A.7 New Zealand to Australia, sea cargo timeline ............................................................ 258
A.8 Time between arrival and removal of goods in Kenya, by mode of transport ............. 259
A.9 Time between arrival and removal of goods in Kenya, by timing of lodgement ............ 260
A.10 Time between arrival and removal of goods in Tanzania, by mode of transport ........... 261
A.11 Time between arrival and removal of goods in Tanzania, by timing of lodgement ........ 261
A.12 The French Customs, Clearance time and Paperless procedures ............................... 263
A.13 The French Customs, AEO certificates issued and demands ...................................... 264
A.14 The French Customs, BTI issued and timing ............................................................... 265
A.15 The French Customs, Rate of non-conformity to Technical Norms ....................... 266
A.16 Evolution of the share of Customs duties in National Revenue* ............................... 267
A.17 Customs duties in National Revenue, by regions (UN classification) ....................... 268

B.1 The Asia-Pacific trade agreements covered by the UNESCAP (in force) ....................... 270
B.2 Percent of Trade agreements related to trade facilitation (at least one dimension) ...... 270
B.3 Number of agreements reported to the WTO by country pairs, according to different 272
categories
B.4 Share of Agreements covering Customs-related procedures, by introduction date ...... 273
B.5 Number of Agreements covered by the new database, since 1958 ............................. 273
B.6 Share of country pairs with agreements covering Customs-related procedures ........... 274

C.1 Total Traffic in TEU, collected between January and December ............................... 279
C.2 Traffic in TEU by Regions, since 1970 (UN classification) ......................................... 280
C.3 The Baltic Dry Index (DBI), an index of raw material maritime costs ....................... 281
C.4 Freight rates by main Maritime Routes, from 1994 to 2008 ....................................... 281
C.5 Regular Shipping Lines by Regions (2008) ............................................................... 282
C.6 Evolution of the capacity of new ships (in TEU) since 1980 .................................... 284
C.7 Maritime Transport Costs (2 digits, importers: all, exporters: all) .............................. 286

D.1 Means of rate of reply, by categories ................................................................. 295
D.2 Rate of reply to the questionnaire, by country and category .................................... 296
F.1 Bilateral Agreements and Conventions ................................................. 359
F.2 Multilateral Agreements and Conventions ........................................... 361
F.3 Agreements related to Customs matters ............................................... 361
F.4 BTI issued and revoked between 2005 and 2009 ................................... 368
F.5 BTI issued and import flows ............................................................... 369
F.6 Overview of the observations of the Court of Auditors (CoA, 2008) ......... 370
F.7 Total number of AEO, by Member States (2008-2011) ......................... 372
F.8 AEO certificates issued by Member States (2008-2011) ....................... 373
F.9 Share of certificates issued by Member States in all European AEO ......... 374
F.10 Number of European AEO issued, by type of certificate (2008-2011) ... 374
F.11 The AEO certificates demands and granted, across the Member States .... 375
F.12 European Customs Projects (1983-1999) ............................................ 377
F.13 European Customs Projects (1999-2014) ............................................ 378
F.14 Number of detention cases by Customs, related to IPR ....................... 379
F.15 Number of cases seized by Member States ........................................ 380
F.16 Market Access Database, Number of cases, by Measures ................... 382
F.17 Market Access Database, Number of cases, by sectors (All Measures) ..... 382
F.18 Percent of cases related to Tariff and Non-tariff barriers*, by aggregate sectors ... 383
List of Tables

1.1  Review of empirical studies on trade facilitation over the last decade  . . . . . . . . . 28
2.1  Time to import/export by category, a comparison between different sources  . . . . . . 43
3.1  Trade Agreements reported to the WTO, by Status  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 54
3.2  Members to the ILAC MRA (countries)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 61
3.3  ASYCUDA installations around the World  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 63
5.1  Impact of the inspection method on time and risk  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 123
5.2  Correlation Matrix of the CSI, the ECSI and its pillars with traditional indicators  . . . 131
5.3  The principal component analysis for the ECSI  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 131
5.4  Component loadings for the ECSI  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 131
5.5  Correspondence table between the GEA surveys and the TFIs  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 133
6.1  Share of the revenue of the EU represented by Customs duties  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 161
6.2  Evolutive EU imports with extra-evolutive EU countries  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 161
6.3  DG TAXUD, Joint action and IT budget  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 165
6.4  Calls for proposals related to trade facilitation  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 170
6.5  Repartition of projects by EC programmes, in Europe  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 170
6.6  Declarations lodged electronically (%)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 177
6.7  Traditional Indicators, Mean of respective ranks (2006-2009)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 193
6.8  Traditional indicators related to Customs efficiency (Rank)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 195
6.9  Indicators related to the Customs environment, from the GCR 2004-2005  . . . . . . . 196
6.10 Traditional indicators related to Customs efficiency (Documents, Time and costs)  . . . 197
6.11 Other traditional indicators related to Customs efficiency  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 198
6.12 Traditional Indicators, Corruption and Transparency (Scores)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . 200
6.13 Traditional Indicators, Corruption and Transparency (Ranks)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . 201
6.14 Traditional indicators related to Infrastructures and ICT (Rank)  . . . . . . . . . . . . 202
6.15 Traditional indicators related to Infrastructure and ICT (Scores)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . 203
6.16 Irregularities reported in OWNRES database*  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 211
6.17 Breakdown by type of irregularities (% of cases)  . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 211
E.3 Rate of Availability (%), by categories .................................................. 350
E.4 Country and ISO3 classification, by Income group .................................. 351
E.5 Country and ISO3 classification, by Region ............................................... 352
E.6 The CSI, the ECSI and its three pillars (Scores) ......................................... 354
E.7 The ECSI and its three pillars (Scores) ...................................................... 355
E.8 The CSI and the different ECSI (Ranks) ................................................... 356
F.1 Classification of cases by Customs areas, based on a wording analysis .......... 357
F.2 The European Union, basic statistics ......................................................... 359
F.3 EC’s Preferential Trade Agreements notified under Article XXIV of the GATT ................................................................. 360
F.4 EU Key Agreements and conventions in the Customs area ......................... 362
F.5 Share in the EU imports (%), Partner: Extra EU-27 ..................................... 364
F.6 Dispatches, share (%) .................................................................................. 365
F.7 Arrivals, share (%) ...................................................................................... 365
F.8 Binding Tariff Information in force, by issuance date ................................... 366
F.9 Binding Tariff Information issued annually (2005-2009) .............................. 367
F.10 Rate (%) of BTI revoked before the 6 years limit* ........................................ 368
F.11 Number of AEO certificates issued by EU Member States ......................... 371
F.12 Customs Staff ........................................................................................... 379
F.13 Cases of different tariff classification ....................................................... 379
F.14 Seizures by Customs of goods infringing IPR, coming from China (%) ........ 380
F.15 Trade Barrier Measures (Market Access Database) .................................... 381
F.16 Sectors codification (Market Access Database) ........................................... 382
F.17 Market Access Database, Non-Tariff Barriers (NTB) by aggregate sectors .... 383
F.18 Number of cases related to non-tariff barriers, by country ......................... 384
G.1 Customs Website and related languages .................................................... 387
Je dédie cette thèse à mon père
To my dad
Abstract

This dissertation explores the narrow dimensions of trade facilitation and their impact on trade. In the first part, I describe the various ways to measure trade facilitation. I explore the traditional indicators of trade facilitation as well as some specific surveys. I indicate several limitations of these commonly used indicators. I also review the role of international arrangements linked to trade facilitation which are rarely taken into account in related studies. Then, I build a composite indicator of trade facilitation which covers various narrow dimensions. It follows the WTO negotiations framework and draws on ninety nine variables. I show that several disparities remain across OECD countries and that information availability, advance rulings and formalities have an important impact on trade. In the second part, I review various trade facilitation dimensions across the World and particularly the European Union. It reveals several disparities and indicates the need to expand the TFIs to a wider set of countries. The European case study suggests that potential gains remain even in developed countries who share similar regulations. It underlines not only some implementation issues but also a path to follow to improve trade facilitation policies. Finally, I provide several insights on the methodology of EU trade facilitation performance.
Résumé

Acknowledgements

As I am writing the last sentences of my Ph.D. dissertation, all these years are now coming back to me. As many Ph.D. students, I have experienced ups and downs but I have always been supported by the people around me, from my supervisor to my family, my friends to my colleagues. I wish to express my gratitude to you all, hoping nobody will be forgotten.

I would first like to dedicate my thesis to my dad who has always been here for me and stimulated my intellectual curiosity. I think of him every day. I know he would be proud of me.

I thank my thesis supervisor, Professor Patrick Messerlin, for his support throughout all these years and particularly during hard times. He gave me useful advice and comments as well as several professional opportunities. I am grateful to the members of my jury, Hildegunn Kyvik Nordas and Richard Pomfret, for having agreed to take part in my defense and being rapporteurs.

I worked two years for the OECD and I would like to thank my supervisor, Evdokia Moïsè, for helping me deepen my knowledge of trade facilitation issues and for introducing me to a great institution. I also thank my colleagues at the OECD, the TAD/TPLS team and particularly my officemates Sébastien Miroudot and Rainer Lanz. I am grateful to my professors throughout my academic studies who have inspired me to look forward. I also thank my colleagues and friends at the GEM. I shared with them a lot of good times and they have helped me through the bad times experienced by all Ph.D. students. I am grateful for all their support during this last year as well as their help in finalizing my thesis. I also would like to thank Barbara Bender for her help and understanding during all these years at the GEM. I thank my new colleagues too who helped create a positive working environment for me during my last year. I would like to thank Mr Xavier Pascual and Jean-Michel Tillier of the French Customs for their comments and data.
In addition to thanking those of my professional life, I would also like to thank my family, particularly my mother Eliane Orliac, my brother François Orliac and my wife LI Qian for their great support, especially during the home stretch. Nothing would have been possible without the attention of Xiaolong. I know that they made many sacrifices for me and I will not forget that. I am back to real life, thanks to you. I also thank my friends, from Bretagne, Paris and all over the world. They contribute to the success of my academic studies by providing me a balanced environment. I would particularly thank Séverine Lamouri for coming with me all these weekends at the library, Chau Nguyen for her constant support, Antoine Berthou for his help, and also Guillaume Gousset for challenging me on *Le Monde*, Anthony Herbe for the beers in the fridge when I came back to Vannes, and Mathieu Pellay and his patner for the "crêpes stop" at Rennes. However, now that my thesis is finally done, you all have to read it!